Approved by the Regents May 15, 2014

PROMOTION RECOMMENDATION The University of Michigan Stephen M. Ross School of Business

Aneel G. Karnani, associate professor of corporate strategy and international business, with tenure, Stephen M. Ross School of Business, is recommended for promotion to professor of corporate strategy and international business, with tenure, Stephen M. Ross School of Business.

Academic Degrees

D.B.A.	1980	Harvard University, Boston, MA
M.B.A.	1974	Indian Institute of Management, Calcutta, India
B.Tech.	1972	Electrical Engineering, Indian Institute of Technology, Bombay, India

Professional Record:

1980 - Present	Associate Professor of Corporate Strategy and International Business, with tenure,
	University of Michigan, Stephen M. Ross School of Business, Ann Arbor, MI
1974 - 1976	Sales Executive, Tata Engineering and Locomotive Company, Bombay, India

Summary of Evaluation:

<u>Teaching</u>: Professor Karnani is among the very best and most accomplished teachers at the Ross School of Business. From 2010 to the present, his average teacher rating is approximately 4.79 on a scale of 1-5. Over this period he has taught the core strategy course in the daytime MBA program and electives on strategies for growth and global strategy, all with the same, extremely high level of success. His course on strategies for growth is among the most popular electives in the school.

Professor Karnani has received many awards for his teaching, including the Teaching Excellence Award on six occasions (1991, 2001, 2006, 2007, 2009, and 2012).

Professor Karnani's particular strengths as a teacher include his exceptional skill in leading case discussions, and the analytical rigor with which he delivers the course content. The consistency with which students specifically mention the analytical rigor of his case teaching suggests that they recognize and appreciate the learning value of his courses.

Professor Karnani has made major contributions in course development, having developed or codeveloped five different courses: Industry and Competitive Analysis; Strategic Management of Operations; Strategies for Global Competition; Competitive Strategies in Emerging Economies; and Strategies for Growth. After developing several of these courses and establishing their popularity, he "handed them off" to other faculty for their benefit and the benefit of the school. In the case of Strategies for Global Competition, he established the course, let a junior faculty member teach it while he filled other teaching needs, and then taught the course again later as needed. The courses that he has designed and his success in teaching them also demonstrate Professor Karnani's exceptional ability to work across disciplinary boundaries, including finance, operations management, and international business. In addition, over the past 33 years the strategy core course has changed in its positioning, duration, and content at least four times and Professor Karnani was responsible for redesigning the course on each occasion. Moreover, he has taught this course for a significant portion of his career at the Ross School.

Professor Karnani was also one of the most active faculty members in the school's Executive Education programs when these programs were a major part of the school's offerings. He was involved in designing and delivering ten different programs. He has also participated in a number of in-company executive

education programs and seminars organized by the Davidson Institute. Finally, Professor Karnani played a significant role in establishing the school's Executive Education programs in Asia.

Overall, considering the exceptional quality and rigor of his teaching, the sheer number of students he has taught every year, the number of courses he has designed and established, and the many programs he has contributed to, Professor Karnani has made truly exceptional contributions to the teaching mission of the Ross School for a very long period of time.

Research: Professor Karnani's primary research contributions are in the domains of bottom of the pyramid (BOP) strategies, corporate social responsibility (CSR), and competitive strategy. In our judgment, Professor Karnani has made a very important contribution in the first domain by developing perhaps the first, systematic and scholarly critique of the BOP perspective. The external reviewers consistently recognized the originality, rigor, and broad-based impact (spanning the relevant academic and practitioner communities) of Professor Karnani's critique, including the various case studies and writings that have contributed to it. His deep understanding of the economics of strategy has provided a key foundation for his critical writings on BOP and CSR, including his specific insights regarding the unrealistic, often implicit assumptions of BOP strategies. Moreover, Professor Karnani has marshaled very compelling case study evidence in support of his theory-based reasoning about the weaknesses of these policies, as a number of the letter writers suggested.

Professor Karnani's earlier body of work made seminal contributions to the competitive strategy literature, as the external reviews consistently indicate. His work on multi-point competition played a major role in the development of this literature, introducing core constructs such as "counterattack" and "mutual foothold equilibrium" that remain central to theorizing, empirical research and teaching about competitive dynamics to this day. Overall, Professor Karnani has become a prominent thought leader in the fields of CSR and BOP, who is also widely recognized for making seminal contributions to the literature on competitive strategy.

Recent and Significant Publications:

Karnani, A. Corporate Social Responsibility Does Not Avert the Tragedy of the Commons -- Case Study: Coca-Cola India. Provisionally accepted for publication in the *Sloan Management Review*.

Karnani, A. <u>Fighting Poverty Together: Rethinking Strategies for Business, Governments, and Civil Society to Reduce Poverty.</u> Palgrave Macmillan, New York, 2011.

Karnani, A. Doing Well By Doing Good. Case Study: 'Fair & Lovely Whitening Cream.' Strategic Management Journal, Vol. 28 (13), pages 1351-1357, December 2007.

Karnani, A. The Mirage of Marketing to the Bottom of the Pyramid. *California Management Review*, Vol. 49 (4), pages 90-111, Summer 2007.

Karnani, A. and Wernerfelt, B. Multiple Point Competition. *Strategic Management Journal*, Vol. 6 (1), 1985.

Service: Professor Karnani has made exceptional service contributions for an associate professor. Perhaps most notably, he served as chair of the strategy group for eight years. Serving as area chair for one three-year term would be an exceptional service (and leadership) contribution for an associate professor. Moreover, he served in this capacity during a period that involved significant change in the direction and faculty composition of the area. Prior to Professor Karnani's terms as chair, the group included faculty in both strategy and operations. Professor Karnani led a major change in the orientation of the group toward mainstream strategic management. The strategy group increased significantly in size

during this period, and Professor Karnani was primarily responsible for (and heavily involved in) this extensive and successful recruiting effort.

Professor Karnani has also made important contributions to the design and curricula of the full-time and part-time MBA programs. He served on a small task force under the associate dean that undertook a significant redesign of the MBA Program. Among the accomplishments of the task force was a redesign of the Multidisciplinary Action (MAP) Program, the development of 2.25 credit courses and the organization of courses in seven-week modules, and changes to the composition and sequencing of the core courses. Professor Karnani was among a select group of faculty who piloted the newly redesigned program. This redesign was subsequently implemented for the entire program, and remains the basic structure for the daytime program and other Ross masters-level programs to this day.

Professor Karnani also served on the Steering Committee of the Davidson Institute. In that capacity he helped determine the strategic direction of the Institute over a period of several years. Professor Karnani and his colleagues developed an ambitious strategy for the institute that involved a broad-based integration into the school's activities, including a balanced commitment to research and MBA teaching on transition and emerging economies and executive programs targeting these countries. Professor Karnani proceeded to help implement this strategy by directing student projects in Russia and the Czech Republic, teaching executive programs in Croatia, Slovakia, the Czech Republic and Hungary, and developing clinical case studies and conducting research with companies in the Czech Republic. In combination with his other contributions, Professor Karnani's service to the school must be considered very exceptional for an associate professor.

External Reviewers:

Reviewer A: "I have no doubt whatsoever that such a promotion is long overdue and that both the quality and quantity of Professor Karnani's scholarly contributions, and even more so their impact on the field of Strategy, warrant his promotion to Full Professor. In addition, I have been lucky enough to witness Aneel Karnani teaching to MBA or Executive Education audiences and I can say without a doubt that he is an outstanding instructor. Overall, Aneel Karnani exhibits a rare combination of excellent teaching and top-quality, meaningful and relevant research. I therefore wholeheartedly support his promotion to Full Professor."

Reviewer B: "Anyone reading the literature in this new domain is quickly led to Aneel's research of recent years. His ability to identify problems of overarching logic and willingness to engage and challenge emerging theories has advanced the state of research... At present at..., Karnani's articles are well recognized by faculty conducting research in this domain. (I would also note that the required reading for one week of a semester long course is comprised exclusively of Karnani's articles.) Outside of his research contributions, over the years Karnani has regularly contributed service to the profession. Additionally, as I am sure is well recognized at Ross, Aneel is an excellent teacher. Professor Karnani offers a very balanced portfolio for promotion. Based on the breadth and quality of his research output, his service to the profession and his demonstrated teaching competence, I am confident that he would be promoted to the rank of Professor at ... I would strongly recommend his promotion to the rank of Professor at the Ross School of Business at Michigan."

Reviewer C: "In my opinion, Professor Karnani is one of the smartest people in the field of business strategy. He is a rigorous thinker with an enormous talent for bringing theory and concepts together with business examples and case data. Karnani is also a superb teacher... ... I urge you to promote Professor Karnani and commend him for his surge of work on the interface between business and society. These are important contributions, and given his recent trajectory, the best work may be yet to come."

Reviewer D: "His work garners attention, challenges pieties, sparks debate, and shifts thinking.....it is clear from his CV and teaching statement that he is a tireless and committed teacher. His teaching and course development combine creativity with analytic rigor, and as a six-time recipient of your school's teaching award...he consistently delivers for students in your MBA and executive programs... His provocative social criticism combined with the promise of his affirmative project and consistently excellent teaching lead me to encourage you to promote him to full professor with tenure."

Reviewer E: "...I recommend Professor Karnani be promoted to 'Professor' with tenure at the Ross School of Business at the University of Michigan. Professor Karnani has made a substantial contribution to the areas of strategy. As Chair of the Strategy Group at Michigan back in the 1990s he helped to lay the foundation of what many today would consider as one of the premier strategy research groups in the world. ...given the constellation of requirements – research, teaching and service – at ... for promotion to 'Professor with tenure,' Professor Karnani would have my support if his case were to come up at..."

Reviewer F: "His early work...lead to a very impressive stream of publications in the top journals... Some of the ideas in these early papers were truly visionary. I often recommend his paper...to my PhD students in corporate strategy... Without hesitation, I would say that he is today seen as being at the forefront of this discussion on exactly how corporations and their strategies can impact urgent public welfare issues... If full professors are supposed to be well published thought leaders in their field, then Dr. Karnani fits the bill perfectly..."

Reviewer G: "...I suspect Aneel Karnani would have already been promoted to the rank of full professor with tenure based both on his previous academic research...and his impressive teaching record. In my humble view, it behooves a large and prestigious research school like the University of Michigan to have on its business faculty someone so dedicated to the vexing issues of public and private policy. In conclusion...I would...be in favor of promoting Aneel Karnani to rank of professor with tenure."

Reviewer H: "...Dr. Karnani has amassed a record of scholarly achievement commensurate with the rank of Full Professor. Dr. Karnani has made several important contributions to the field of business strategy. He is a world class researcher. I strongly urge you to promote him to Full Professor."

Reviewer I: "Aneel has had a long and distinguished career on your faculty with a very strong portfolio of activities in all three major areas: teaching, research and service. Having made strong contributions in all these areas, Dr. Karnani is richly deserving of this promotion. I enthusiastically support such a decision and look forward to Professor Karnani's further research."

Summary of Recommendation:

Professor Karnani has made very substantial contributions to the Ross School over the course of his career. With this in mind, the Executive Committee and I strongly recommend Aneel G. Karnani for promotion to professor of corporate strategy and international business, with tenure, Stephen M. Ross School of Business.

Alison Davis-Blake

Edward J. Frey Dean of Business Stephen M. Ross School of Business

Oleon Davis-Blake